

Setti D. Warren Mayor

City of Newton, Massachusetts

Department of Planning and Development 1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, Massachusetts 02459

Telephone (617) 796-1120 Telefax (617) 796-1142 TDD/TTY (617) 796-1089 www.newtonma.gov

Candace Havens Director

MINUTES OF PUBLIC MEETING AND PUBLIC HEARINGS **NEWTON HISTORICAL COMMISSION**

DATE: January 24, 2013

PLACE/TIME: City Hall, Room 202

7:00 p.m.

ATTENDING: **David Morton, Acting Chair**

William Roesner, Member

Brian Lever, Staff

Nancy Grissom, Member

Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

See Attendance List

ABSENT: **Donald Lang, Chair**

> Rodney Barker, Member **Donald Tellalian, Alternate** Leonard Sherman, Alternate

The meeting was called to order at 7:00 p.m. with David Morton presiding as Acting Chair. Voting permanent members were Morton, Grissom, Roesner, and Wojciechowski. Brian Lever acted as recording secretary and the meeting was digitally recorded.

128 Highland Street – Demolition Review

Property owner Stefanos Efstratoudakis presented an application to demolish the residence. The Commission reviewed the application, historical documentation on the property, photographs of the property, and letters submitted in opposition to the proposed demolition. Staff stated that this building is believed to have been constructed circa 1846 likely in Greek Revival style and was originally located on Chestnut Street. By 1874, the building was moved to its current location. The building is shown on historic maps at its present location since 1874. The Howland family owned the property from at least 1855 to approximately 1886. It was first owned by David Howland who is believed to have moved the building in the early 1870s to make room for his new home at what is now 129 Chestnut Street. David was a partner in Howland, Hinckley and Company at 174 Commercial Street, a ship chandlery business supplying nautical equipment and retired in 1886. David Howland passed this building to his son Charles.

Charles Howland worked in the paint and varnish business and developed properties for sale in



Newton along Chestnut and Prince Streets. 128 Highland Street after Howland ownership was substantially modified in the 1890s with the addition of a Queen Anne style tower. It was modified again during the 20th century with additions off of the south façade. During the 1960s it was owned by Fabian Bachrach a famous photographer. The building retains historic features and details.

Efstratoudakis stated that the building had been moved to its current location and that subsequent additions had not been properly tied into the building. Efstratoudakis stated that the building had structural problems, that the floorboards were not properly secured, and that the foundation consisted of several temporary supports. Efstratoudakis further stated that the existing shared driveway ran immediately by the dining room and that since the property had been subdivided, the house was located awkwardly positioned on the lot located close to the property line. Grissom asked if the building could be moved and Efstratoudakis responded that he had consulted building movers who were concerned that since the building had been moved previously and subsequently added onto, that it may not be able to be safely moved again. Efstratoudakis stated that he wished to stay at the property and construct a smaller house.

Grissom stated that she supported the preservation of the building. Wojciechowski stated that Efstratoudakis presented a good case for the issues with the building and that the demolition delay provided time to examine these issues and consider options. Peggy McIntosh (former owner) stated that she valued the historic homes in West Newton Hill and supported the building's preservation. Ken McIntosh (former owner) stated that the house was not an easy house to live in, but that it has irreplaceable historic detail and fits the neighborhood. Abutter Julia Bell stated that she supported the preservation of the building and discussed the building's history as a residence for commuters to Boston and later the home of the Bachrach family. Morton expressed sympathy for the issues with the building, but supported its preservation. Wojciechowski motioned to find the building preferably preserved with Roesner seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>January 24, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

RESOLVED to find the residence at 128 Highland Street Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

David Morton, Acting Chair Nancy Grissom, Member

William Roesner, Member Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

43 Van Roosen Road - Demolition Review

Bill Pybas representing the property owner presented an application to demolish the residence. The Commission reviewed the application and photographs of the property. Staff stated that this 1948 Ranch style home is located within Oak Hill Park, but not on the path system. According to the 1953 City directory the occupants were Robert (a store manager) and Marcia Jamron. The building was altered with a series of additions. An addition was constructed off of the north façade in 1950, the west (front) façade in 1963, and the south façade in 1964. Presently, the building has a combination of wood shingle and vinyl siding as well as replacement windows. The surrounding context consists of original Oak Hill Park residences some of which have been altered, as well as new replacement buildings. Grissom noted that the building had had several

alterations. Roesner asked where the driveway was located in relation to its new location and Pybas stated that the driveway was located at the rear off of L Roadway and will be located off of Van Roosen Road. Wojciechowski stated that the fact that the property fronted on two streets creates confusion. Grissom motioned to find the property not preferably preserved and Wojciechowski seconded.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>January 24, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

RESOLVED to find the residence at 43 Van Roosen Road Not Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

David Morton, Acting Chair Nancy Grissom, Member

William Roesner, Member Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

9 Chandler Street - Demolition Review

Doug Agule representing the property owner presented an application to demolish the residence. The Commission reviewed the application, historical documentation, and photographs of the property. Staff stated that this property consists of two lots under the same ownership with a small circa 1870 residence and a circa 1900 barn at the rear of the adjacent lot. The property was owned by Timothy Kinsella who was a laborer and later a watchman at the Silver Lake Cordage Company. Kinsella had several outbuildings including the surviving barn, but only the present accessory building remains. The property remained in Kinsella's ownership through the early 20th century and then was owned by family members. The house has been substantially altered with asbestos siding and replacement windows as well as additions on the front façade and rear of the building. The barn's original form appears to be intact, though it appears to have suffered some deterioration. Neither building retains any significant historic features. The surrounding neighborhood context consists of a variety of different residences from different time periods as well as commercial buildings.

Agule stated that the house had been substantially altered. Grissom noted that the barn was in poor condition. Grissom motioned to find both buildings not preferably preserved with Wojciechowski seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>January 24, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

RESOLVED to find the residence and barn at <u>9 Chandler Street</u> Not Preferably Preserved.

Voting in the Affirmative:

David Morton, Acting Chair Nancy Grissom, Member

William Roesner, Member Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

56 Farlow Road – Demolition Review

Architect Joseph Kennard and property owner Laura Otting presented an application to construct an addition. The Commission reviewed the application, historical documentation, proposed plans, and photographs of the property. Staff stated that this 1903 Shingle / Colonial Revival style



residence is located within the Farlow Hill National Register Historic District, and therefore may be subject to an 18-month demolition delay. This district is listed for its examples of early 20th century architecture. This building is an example of transitional architecture when Victorian styles gave way to the more modern styles of the early 20th century. The applicants are proposing to construct an addition off of the east façade which will cover slightly more than 50%, therefore requiring a filing under the demolition delay ordinance. The process for reviewing additions is the same for full demolition with the Commission first needing to find the building preferably preserved or not and if preferably preserved, then determining whether or not to issue a waiver of the demolition delay.

Kennard stated that the intention was to restore the historic building while adding an addition to accommodate additional space and an attached garage. Kennard stated that the project encompassed slightly more than 50% of a façade, the filing threshold for review. Commission members discussed the building and its historic features as well as the neighborhood context. Wojciechowski motioned to find the building preferably preserved, with Grissom seconding, this motion passed.

Kennard discussed the design of the proposed addition including proposed exterior cladding such as stone, casement windows, and a slate roof. Kennard presented a letter of support for the project. Wojciechowski expressed concern over the massing and scale of the proposed addition. Roesner stated that the addition was longer than the existing building creating a large mass when viewed from the street. Kennard stated that the programmatic concerns informed the design and that less room was needed on the second floor, therefore the roof was lowered rather than a higher roof like the existing building which would have created a more massive addition. Wojciechowski stated that some of the positives of the design were that there was a lower mass on the second floor and that the proposed garage doors did not face the street. Wojciechowski further stated that he was concerned about the proportions of the new addition and existing building and thought that there should be more of a balance between the existing building and proposed addition. Morton and Wojciechowski requested further information regarding the proposed design including three dimensional images. Wojciechowski expressed concern over the single ridge line on the proposed addition. Roesner suggested that the new addition could have a smaller subservient connector between it and the new addition. Grissom stated that the Durant-Kenrick project at 286 Waverley Avenue could serve as an example of a transitional connector and new addition. Roesner motioned to deny a request for a waiver of the demolition delay as the proposed design lacks relationship with the existing building; this motion was not seconded and failed to pass. Commission members asked if they were under any obligation to issue a waiver of the delay and staff responded that they were not. Morton suggested that the project could be redesigned to not require review. No further action was taken on this item.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>January 24, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

RESOLVED to find the residence at 56 Farlow Road Preferably Preserved.

<u>Voting in the Affirmative:</u>
David Morton, Acting Chair

Nancy Grissom, Member



142 Homer Street - Demolition Review

Property owners Babak Veyssi and John Severini, attorney Terrence Morris and architect Kent Duckham presented an application to waive the demolition delay on the residence based upon plans for additions. The Commission reviewed the application, historical documentation, proposed plans, and photographs of the property. Staff stated that this property consisted of a historic 1874 residence and carriage house both placed on a demolition delay in June of 2012 and that the applicants were returning to seek a waiver of the demolition delay and a cessation of the landmark nomination process based upon plans to preserve both buildings. Veyssi stated that they had met with the neighbors and aldermen to discuss the project and had gone through different designs to arrive at the proposed design. Duckham stated that the building would have a new front entrance added as well as a new window to what is now the north side of the building facing Homer Street. Duckham further stated that additions would be added to the east and west sides of the building and the rear utilizing wood siding, wood shutters, and wood simulated divided light windows. Alderman Danberg stated that the neighbors, developers, and aldermen had worked together and that the present design addressed their concerns. Alderman Danberg further suggested that the property have a granite curb in front of it like others on the street and Veyssi stated that they would do so. Alderman Blazar stated that he was happy with the result and the process. Neighbors David Corey, Diane Finkelstein, and Richard Cohn stated that they were pleased with the result. Alderman Danberg stated that based upon the presented plans, she wished to cancel the landmark nomination process. Roesner recommended copper gutters and downspouts. Grissom motioned to issue a waiver of the demolition delay with Wojciechowski seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>January 24, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>4-0</u>,

RESOLVED to waive the demolition delay on the residence at <u>142 Homer Street</u> with the following conditions: (1) that the approval is based upon the plans and materials information submitted with the Commission requiring use of wood clapboards, wood shutters, and wood simulated divided light windows with a 2/2 muntin pattern; (2) that the Commission prohibits the use of aluminum gutters and downspouts and recommends use of copper gutters and downspouts; (3) that the Commission requires the installation of a granite curb in front of the house; and (4) that revised plans with materials information be submitted and approved by staff prior to issuance of a building permit.

Voting in the Affirmative:

David Morton, Acting Chair Nancy Grissom, Member

William Roesner, Member Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

1832 Washington Street (39 Stanton Avenue) - Demolition Review

Future property owner Steve Vona presented an application to waive the demolition delay based upon plans for proposed additions. Staff stated that this property has been occupied since the 18th century with a series of different buildings including residences and outbuildings. This building was once attached to 1828 Washington Street. 1828 and 1832 Washington Street (39 Stanton Avenue) together made up portions of the Shepard farm, an 18th century farm complex

associated with Alexander Shepard, a prominent Newton citizen. The Commission placed a demolition delay on the property at the December 2012 meeting. Wojciechowski asked what the proposed materials were and Vona responded that wood would be used throughout including simulated divided light windows. Vona stated that the proposed additions were designed to emulated rear ells and a barn. Grissom motioned to issue a waiver of the demolition delay with Wojciechowski seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>January 24, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

RESOLVED to waive the demolition delay on the residence at 1832 Washington Street (39 Stanton Avenue) with the following conditions: (1) that the approval is based upon the plans and materials information provided with the Commission requiring use of wood clapboards, wood shutters, and wood simulated divided light windows; (2) that the Commission permits but does not require the installation of small barn-like windows in the proposed attached garage; and (3) that revised plans with materials information be submitted and approved by staff prior to issuance of a building permit.

Voting in the Affirmative:

David Morton, Acting Chair Nancy Grissom, Member

William Roesner, Member Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

25 Sheffield Road - Demolition Review

Property owner Frank Utano presented a revised design as part of an application to waive the demolition delay. Commission members reviewed the application and revised plans. Staff stated that a waiver of the demolition delay had been granted at the December 2012 meeting. The Commission at that time required revisions including more consistent muntin patterns, the addition of three dimensional elements on the left façade and further information on proposed materials. Wojciechowski expressed concern regarding the roundness of the proposed stone and suggested use of an ashlar granite. Wojciechowski motioned to issue a final approval with Grissom seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>January 24, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

RESOLVED to issue a final approval to waive the demolition delay on the residence at <u>25 Sheffield</u> Road based upon the submitted plans and materials information.

Voting in the Affirmative:

David Morton, Acting Chair Nancy Grissom, Member

William Roesner, Member Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

54-56 Elm Street – Demolition Review

Property owner Lev Romm presented an application to waive the demolition delay based upon plans for a replacement building. Staff stated that This circa 1875 Queen Anne style home is located in West Newton in a neighborhood of other late 19th century residences with a strong historic context. In 2012, the Commission placed a demolition delay on 37 Elm Street across the

street, which is presently being renovated and will have an addition added to it. The demolition delay was placed on the building in August 2012. Romm stated that the existing building had been altered with additions and subdivided into four separate dwelling units. Grissom noted the alterations that have occurred to the building. Commission members reviewed the proposed design for the replacement building.

Wojciechowski suggested having the building have a front entrance on Elm Street. Grissom suggested incorporating elements and features from the existing building in the proposed building. Wojciechowski suggested adding projecting bays and three dimensional elements to the building. Roesner suggested breaking up the roof with further articulation of the proposed dormers. Grissom asked what the proposed windows would be and Romm responded that they would be wood windows. Wojciechowski motioned to waive the demolition delay with Grissom seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>January 24, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of <u>4-0</u>,

RESOLVED to waive the demolition delay on the residence at <u>54-56 Elm Street</u> with the following conditions: (1) that the approval is conceptual based upon the plans and materials information provided with the Commission requiring use of wood simulated divided light windows; (2) that the Commission requires that architectural features from the existing building be incorporated in the proposed building; (3) that the design incorporate three dimensional elements and articulation; and (4) that revised plans with materials information be submitted and approved by a Commission member prior to issuance of a building permit.

Voting in the Affirmative:

David Morton, Acting Chair Nancy Grissom, Member

William Roesner, Member Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

Administrative Discussion

Minutes:

The Commission approved the minutes from December 2012 with Morton and Wojciechowski abstaining.

Commission membership:

Staff stated that due to expired appointments; the Mayor's Office is reviewing reappointments and the potential for new members. Members interested in being reappointed should submit a letter of interest and a brief resume to:

Ana Gonzalez

Director of Community Engagement Executive Office, City of Newton 1000 Commonwealth Avenue Newton, MA 02459 agonzalez@newtonma.gov



Other Projects/Proposals:

Morton asked for the status of other preservation projects and initiatives including a proposal to combine the historic district commissions. Staff stated that this initiative has been discussed, but review and approval by the Board of Aldermen was required and thus far this has not yet occurred. Staff stated that another initiative to assist in the preservation of historic barns and carriage houses by creating an expedited review process for them to be converted into accessory apartments was under consideration. Wojciechowski asked how this could be accomplished and staff stated that review and approval by the Board of Aldermen was required. Grissom motioned for the Commission to docket this idea with the Board of Aldermen for discussion with Wojciechowski seconding.

At a scheduled meeting and public hearing on <u>January 24, 2013</u> the Newton Historical Commission, by vote of 4-0,

RESOLVED to docket with the Board of Aldermen the following item: the Newton Historical Commission requests creation of an expedited review process for converting historic barns and carriage houses into accessory apartments as a means of assisting in their preservation

Voting in the Affirmative:

David Morton, Acting Chair William Roesner, Member Nancy Grissom, Member Alfred Wojciechowski, Member

Meeting was adjourned at 10:15.